



Administrative Report

N.1., File # 23-5859

Meeting Date: 4/11/2023

To: MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL
From: PATRICK BUTLER, INTERIM FIRE CHIEF

TITLE

DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A FEASIBILITY STUDY BY THE CONSOLIDATED FIRE PROTECTION DISTRICT OF LOS ANGELES COUNTY (DISTRICT) FOR THE PROVISION OF FIRE PROTECTION, PARAMEDIC, MARINE, AND INCIDENTAL SERVICES FOR THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH

DIRECTION TO PROCEED WITH EXECUTION OF A REIMBURSEMENT AGREEMENT WITH THE DISTRICT TO PERFORM PHASE 2 OF THE FEASIBILITY STUDY TO SURVEY CITY FACILITIES AND EQUIPMENT AND DETERMINE THE COST TO CONVERT FIRE AND EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICES (EMS) OPERATIONS TO DISTRICT SERVICE

DIRECTION TO HIRE A THIRD-PARTY CONSULTANT TO REVIEW THE CITY'S FIRE/EMS OPERATING MODEL/COSTS AND THE DISTRICT'S PROPOSED OPERATING MODEL/COSTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At the March 14, 2023 Redondo Beach City Council meeting, a referral was made to bring forward a discussion item regarding the feasibility study performed by the Consolidated Fire Protection District of Los Angeles County (District) to provide fire protection, paramedic, marine and incidental services for the City of Redondo Beach.

Personnel in the Redondo Beach Fire Department and staff from the City Manager's Office have been in communication with the District to discuss the cost, scope, and process to consider District provided contract Fire/EMS. On February 10, 2023, the City received a proposal from the District for an alternative staffing model with an estimated annual cost of \$18.6M. The February cost estimate included "cost sharing." Subsequently, the City was notified by District personnel that the District discontinued cost sharing in their service contracts and on April 6th, provided staff with an updated annual cost estimate of \$20.1M.

The next step in the process is to enter into a Reimbursement Agreement between the City and District to allow for completion of Phase 2 of the study which includes a survey of City facilities, vehicles, equipment, and infrastructure in order to determine the cost to convert to District Fire/EMS service. While surveying City facilities the District would also begin contract preparation. Upon Council approval, staff would work with District personnel to prepare the Reimbursement Agreement between the two agencies and return with an item for agreement approval on April 18th or May 2nd. The District survey is expected to take approximately 4-6 weeks to complete. It should be noted that

the District plans to have Deputy Fire Chief Jon O'Brien and other administrative staff attend the City Council Meeting to answer any related questions.

Additionally, the City Council has expressed interest in hiring a third-party consultant to review the operating model and costs for both City and District proposed Fire/EMS. Staff have researched possible firms to conduct the review and identified three consultants who have recently performed similar work for Fire agencies in Southern California. It is recommended that the City Council direct staff to request qualifications and costs from these firms (and others if they are interested) and return on May 2nd with a short list of consulting contract options.

BACKGROUND

The Redondo Beach Fire Department is designated as a Class 1 Fire Department by the Insurance Services Office (Footnote 1) and is staffed by 62 sworn firefighters who provide fire suppression, paramedic, harbor/marine, fire prevention and other services through three community-based fire stations, and the staffing of 3 Paramedic Assessment Fire Engines, 1 Paramedic Assessment Truck, 2 Paramedic Squads, 1 Paramedic Assessment Squad, 1 Paramedic Fire Rescue Boat, 3 Division Chiefs, 1 Fire Chief/Harbor Master and 5 civilian support staff at an estimated annual cost of \$21.2M (Footnote 2).

The District proposal provides fire suppression, paramedic, harbor/marine, fire prevention and other services through three community-based fire stations. Daily staffing includes 2 Paramedic Assessment Fire Engines, 1 Paramedic Assessment Quint, 3 Paramedic Squads, 1 Paramedic Fire Rescue Boat, at an estimated annual cost of \$20.1M. The District's proposed staffing model represents a net elimination of 1 Paramedic Assessment Fire Engine, 1 Fire Chief/Harbor Master, 3 Division Chiefs, and 5 support staff compared to current Fire Department staffing and adjustments to Harbor Patrol Fire/EMS operations.

Third-Party Consultant Review

There are several consultants that provide fire departments with a range of specialized services that include deployment analysis, decision analysis, municipal budgeting, agency mergers, joint powers agreements, facility surveys, community risk assessments, standards of coverage and other services that could assist the City through this process. Staff has contacted known consultants in this space to determine the general type and scope of work required for this process.

Below is a list of three firms, in alphabetical order, that have provided similar analytical studies for local municipalities evaluating options for the provision of Fire/EMS service within their jurisdictions:

- AP Triton LLC - recently provided fire and EMS consulting services for the City of La Verne, CA. The firm conducted a phased study beginning with a Community Risk Assessment followed by a Standards of Coverage and Deployment Analysis. They also provided an evaluation of other agency proposals.
- Citygate Associates LLC - recently provided consulting services to the City of Hermosa Beach, CA. The firm conducted an analysis, evaluation and cost comparison proposal for the Fire Department. This firm also conducted a Standards of Cover and Deployment Analysis for the City of San Diego.

- Matrix Consulting Group - has worked locally with the City of Huntington Beach and other Fire/EMS agencies, and most recently with the San Diego North County Fire Protection District, conducting studies of staffing, management, standard of coverage, feasibility studies and other public safety work.

Each consultant indicated that they could perform similar services for the City of Redondo Beach at a cost that is roughly equal to or less than the \$60,000 set aside by the City Council in the FY 2022-23 Budget. The firms also stated that the review is expected to take 4-6 months to complete. It is recommended that the City Council direct staff to initiate an abbreviated Request for Costs and Qualifications (RFCQ) from the third-party consultants to review the City and District proposed Fire/EMS costs and prepare a report, with recommendations, for City Council consideration. If directed, staff expect to return to the City Council with a short list of consulting contract options at the May 2nd City Council Meeting.

COORDINATION

The Redondo Beach Fire Department coordinated this item with the Finance Department and City Manager's Office.

FISCAL IMPACT

The City Council appropriated \$30,000 in the Fiscal Year 2022-23 Budget to pay for Phase 2 of the District's Feasibility Study and \$60,000 to hire a third-party consultant. The costs for the Reimbursement Agreement (estimated at \$24,000) and the third-party consulting services work (estimated to be at or below \$60,000) is expected to be within the approved budgets, depending on the final approved scopes of work.

APPROVED BY:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

ATTACHMENTS

- Letter - Los Angeles County Fire Department, Feasibility Study for the Provision of Fire Protection, Paramedic, Marine, and Incidental Services for the City of Redondo Beach, February 10, 2023
- Updated District Cost Estimate Provided to City Staff on April 6, 2023
- Budget - Fire Department FY 2022-23 Adopted Budget
- Budget Report - Year-to-Date Pension Obligation Bond Debt Service Cost Allocations by Department, Page 5-Fire and Fire Special Services
- Report - AP Triton, City of La Verne, Community Risk Assessment: Standards of Cover Deployment Analysis, June 2022
- Report - Citygate Associates, LLC., San Diego Fire-Rescue Department, Volume 1 of 3 Executive Summary, February 22, 2017
- Report - Matrix Consulting Group, North County Fire Protection District, Fallbrook, CA, June 30, 2022

¹ The ISO is a nationwide nonprofit service organization that provides rating and other services to property and casualty insurance industries. ISO's Fire Suppression Rating Schedule classifies fire protection into 10 categories, Class 1

recognizing the highest level of fire protection and Class 10 recognizing the lowest or no level of fire protection.

² The adopted Fiscal Year 2022/23 Fire Department Budgeted Cost is \$24,554,783 minus \$3,301,399 of assigned annual pension bond debt service expenses, for a net total of \$21,253,384. Fixed pension bond debt service costs remain with the City regardless of contracting with the District.