



Minutes  
Redondo Beach City Council  
Tuesday, May 9, 2023  
Closed Session - 4:30 p.m. – Cancelled  
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

**4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – CANCELLED**

**6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION - REGULAR MEETING**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim at 6:00 p.m. in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

**B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Obagi, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Brand

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Michael Webb, City Attorney  
Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk  
Vickie Kroneberger, Chief Deputy City Clerk

**C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION**

At the request of Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, the audience and Councilmembers rose to salute the flag followed by a moment of silence.

**D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Councilmember Loewenstein announced the District 2 community meeting will be held on May 23rd at 6:00 p.m. on Zoom and thanked Public Safety and Public Works for their work on the recent Beach Life Festival as well as City staff and residents.

Councilmember Kaluderovic expressed her appreciation to City staff for the success of the recent Beach Life Festival.

Councilmember Obagi spoke favorably on the recent Beach Life Festival; noted many District 4 residents expressed appreciation for the new Stop sign on Huntington Lane and thanked Public Works Director Samaan and the Public Works Department.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim thanked City staff, including Public Works for their work in preparing for Beach Life Festival; gave a shout out to Beach Life Festival producers for maintaining coastal access; spoke about the new City logo design and reported the public can provide input on the City's website; announced the District 1 community meeting will be held at Alta Vista, Saturday, May 13th at 9:30 a.m. and discussed attending an educational event for West Basin, a water purveyor in the City of El Segundo.

**E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA**

City Manager Witzansky requested removing Item No. H.6. from the agenda and noted the item will return to the next City Council meeting.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim asked to change the order of the agenda to consider Items No. P.1., N.2., L.1. and N.1., after Item No. J., in that order and follow the rest of the agenda, as presented, subsequently.

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to approve the agenda, as amended, to consider Items No. P.1., N.2., L.1. and N.1., after Item No. J., in that order and follow the rest of the agenda, as presented, subsequently. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

**F. AGENCY RECESS - None**

**G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

**G.1. For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting**

Chief Deputy City Clerk Kroneberger reported there are three Blue Folder Items including for Items No. H.7., J.1., and L.1.

Motion by Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to receive and file Blue Folder Items. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

**H. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING OF MAY 9, 2023**

**CONTACT:** ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

**H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA**

**CONTACT:** ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

**H.3. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar by Councilmember Kaluderovic.**

**H.4. EXCUSE ABSENCES FROM VARIOUS COMMISSION AND COMMITTEE MEETINGS.**

**CONTACT:** ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

**H.5. REGRETFULLY ACCEPT THE RESIGNATION OF COMMISSIONER RON MAROKO FROM THE HISTORICAL COMMISSION AND AUTHORIZE THE CITY CLERK TO POST THE VACANCY.**

**CONTACT:** ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

**H.6. APPROVE THE AGREEMENT FOR LEGAL SERVICES WITH ATTORNEY CARRIE ELLIOTT AS OUTSIDE COUNSEL IN LEGAL MATTERS AS NEEDED AND ADD HER TO THE CITY ATTORNEY'S LIST OF APPROVED LAW FIRMS AND ATTORNEYS.**

**CONTACT:** MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY

This item was pulled from the agenda by City Manager Witzansky and will be included in Council's next meeting agenda.

**H.7. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar by Councilmember Kaluderovic.**

**H.8. APPROVAL OF AN AGREEMENT FOR LEGAL SERVICES WITH MEYERS NAVE**

**CONTACT: MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY**

Councilmember Obagi left the meeting.

Councilmember Kaluderovic pulled Items No. H.3. and H.7. from the Consent Calendar for separate consideration.

There were no public comments on the Consent Calendar.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, to approve the Consent Calendar, as presented, except for Items No. H.3. and H.7., which were pulled for separate consideration and Item No. H.6., which was pulled from the agenda by City staff. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

**I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS**

**H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES:**

**A. OCTOBER 4, 2022 REGULAR MEETING**

**B. OCTOBER 11, 2022 ADJOURNED & REGULAR MEETING**

**C. MARCH 21, 2023 ADJOURNED & REGULAR MEETING**

**D. MARCH 24, 2023 SPECIAL**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim moved to approve Item No. H.3., as presented, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein. The motion carried with the following roll call vote:

The Motion carried, 2-0-2, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim

NOES: None

ABSENT: Obagi

ABSTAIN: Behrendt, Kaluderovic

**H.7. APPROVE THE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH BOBBY JAMAAL SAMPSON/ALL LOVE WELLNESS GROUP, LLC, TO PROVIDE MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES FOR PEOPLE WITH MENTAL DISORDERS LOCATED IN REDONDO BEACH AND PARTICIPANTS OF HOMELESS COURT FOR THE AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$60,000 FOR THE TERM OF MAY 3, 2023 UNTIL JUNE 30, 2024**

**APPROVE THE BUSINESS ASSOCIATION AGREEMENT WITH BOBBY JAMAAL SAMPSON/ALL LOVE WELLNESS GROUP, LLC.**

**CONTACT: MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY**

Councilmember Obagi returned to the meeting.

In reply to Councilmember Kaluderovic's question regarding this item, City Attorney Webb reported that Council's direction was to act as judiciously as possible and deferred to Housing Navigator Lila Omura to expand on the

report.

Housing Navigator Lila Omura spoke favorably about working with Mr. Sampson and his experience and qualifications and shared cases which he was successful in resolving.

Discussion followed regarding insurance requirements, contracting with the service provider (not the LLC), approving the item pending submission of appropriate insurance documentation, the fee schedule and terms, the reason for providing services only on weekends and exploring expansion of the contract with outside Housing Navigators to provide coverage seven days a week.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, to APPROVE THE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH BOBBY JAMAAL SAMPSON/ALL LOVE WELLNESS GROUP, LLC, TO PROVIDE MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES FOR PEOPLE WITH MENTAL DISORDERS LOCATED IN REDONDO BEACH AND PARTICIPANTS OF HOMELESS COURT FOR THE AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$60,000 FOR THE TERM OF MAY 3, 2023 UNTIL JUNE 30, 2024.

Bobby Jamal Sampson, via Zoom, spoke about his experience in community-based mental health programs; explained that working on the weekends, at first, will allow him to assess the need in the community and expressed appreciation for the opportunity to serve.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Substitute motion by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to APPROVE THE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH BOBBY JAMAAL SAMPSON/ALL LOVE WELLNESS GROUP, LLC, TO PROVIDE MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES FOR PEOPLE WITH MENTAL DISORDERS LOCATED IN REDONDO BEACH AND PARTICIPANTS OF HOMELESS COURT FOR THE AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$60,000 FOR THE TERM OF MAY 3, 2023 UNTIL JUNE 30, 2024, but not sign the contract or begin work until submission and verification of insurance requirements by the Risk Manager. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

## **J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

### **J.1. For eComments and Emails Received from the Public**

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim opened Public Participation on Non-Agenda Items.

Sara Martin, District 1, discussed the Redondo Beach Sailing Club, a 501(c)3 non-profit, its members' use of City boats for informal sailing instruction and practice as part of an informal arrangement with the City and the City's notice that it would not longer be permitted to use City sail boats; referenced a lease with the Portofino and the Coastal Commission's determination that the City has, for 14 years, violated lease terms for the Portofino by assuming control of the two slips reserved for exclusive use by a non-profit club and asked Council to direct City staff to immediately, fully comply with the Portofino lease by assigning the slips to the Redondo Beach Sailing Club.

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to receive and file documents submitted by Sara Martin. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Nikki Negrete Mitchell, District 3, Founding Member of Redondo Beach Quality of Life Coalition, Managing Partner of Right of Say, spoke about the growing organizations; thanked Council for supporting them and taking their comments regarding the Green Line extension; discussed their progress in their quest for understanding and promoting unity; commented on the spread of misinformation and asked that Council make it publicly known that spreading misinformation and bullying can no longer be tolerated and that Council remind counterparts that no decision has been made on the alignment and that the right-of-way is not a sure thing.

Mark Hansen, King Harbor Boater and Supporter of the King Harbor Youth Foundation, discussed details of a recent Youth Race and thanked volunteers.

Rita Lloyd thanked Council for approving the installation of additional electric vehicle charging stations.

Kyle Johnson, via Zoom, spoke about improving bike and bus access in the South Bay; suggested the City explore adding more bike lanes in the community and improving bus access and encouraged the community to invest in public access and alternative modes of transportation.

Holly Osborne, via Zoom, played an audio clip of a Lawndale City Council meeting where the City of Lawndale expressed support for the Hawthorne option of the Green Line.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim asked that Dr. Osborne send a link to the City Clerk's office to disperse to Council and staff.

Julie Coll, Waterfront Education, via Zoom, asked that the City step up to support sailing instruction in the City; noted agreement with Sara Martin and hoped the City will make this a priority.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Kroneberger reported two eComments were received on this item.

There were no other public comments and Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed Public Participation on Non-Agenda Items.

Council considered Item No. P.1. at this point on the agenda.

#### **K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Councilmember Loewenstein reported speaking with Mayor Brand regarding Item No. L.1.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported speaking with City staff regarding item No. L.1.

Councilmember Obagi reported speaking with Mayor Brand, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim and City staff.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim reported speaking with Councilmember Obagi, City staff, Mayor Brand and members of the public.

Councilmember Behrendt reported speaking with Mayor Brand and City staff.

#### **L. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

##### **L.1. PUBLIC HEARING FOR CONSIDERATION OF AN APPEAL OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR'S NOTICE OF INCOMPLETE APPLICATION DATED MARCH 3, 2023 FOR A PROPOSED MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT AT 1100 N. HARBOR DRIVE, REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA 90277 AS APPEALED ON MARCH 9, 2023 PURSUANT TO REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE SECTION 1-4.01 GENERAL APPEAL PROCEDURES**

##### **PROCEDURE:**

**The public hearing is to be structured in the following order, subject to the Rules of Conduct for City Council meetings:**

- 1. Announcement and motion to open the public hearing;**
- 2. Motion to receive and file affidavit of publication, case file, and written correspondence;**

3. Staff presentation;
4. Public testimony and presentation of evidence;
  - a. Proponent maximum of 1 hour;
  - b. Public comment 3 minutes each;
  - c. Proponent rebuttal 20 minutes.
5. City Council questions;
6. Motion to close public hearing;
7. City Council discussion and debate;
8. Motion and action.

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2305-043, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, OVERTURNING THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR'S DECISION TO DEEM THE APPLICATION INCOMPLETE AND AUTHORIZING THE REVIEW OF THE APPLICATION FOR A PROPOSED MIXED-USE HOUSING PROJECT LOCATED AT 1100 N. HARBOR DRIVE [APN: 7503-013-014; 7503-013-015; 7503-013-819; 7503-013-820]**

**OR**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2305-043, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, UPHOLDING THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR'S DECISION TO DEEM THE APPLICATION INCOMPLETE FOR A PROPOSED MIXED-USE HOUSING PROJECT LOCATED AT 1100 N. HARBOR DRIVE [APN: 7503-013-014; 7503-013-015; 7503-013-819; 7503-013-820]**

**CONTACT:** BRANDY FORBES, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, to open the public hearing. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, to receive and file the affidavit of publication, case file, and written correspondence. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Community Development Director Forbes narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the report.

City Attorney Webb reported Council received a letter of technical assistance from HCD; stated he disagrees with HCD as a matter of statutory interpretation and deferred to Legal Counsel Varat.

Legal Counsel Varat explained procedural provisions relative to submission and compliance of the Housing Element; confirmed the City adopted its Housing Element on July 5, 2022 and HCD determined its compliance on September 1, 2022 and discussed rezoning requirements.

City Attorney Webb referenced an opinion letter from Michael Tsi, Counsel for the Council of Carpenters, where he explains the project is not subject to the Housing Accountability Act and Builders Remedy and that, in fact, the City's Housing Element was certified. Additionally, he asserted the applicant has filed an incomplete application in terms of ownership and other elements.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim invited the applicant to address City Council.

Michael Schonefeld, on behalf of 9300 Wilshire, LLC, referenced the Permit Streamlining Act which sets up a process for addressing incomplete documentation; alleged the City did not like the project and therefore, requested submission of a different one; spoke about Builders Remedy as the ability to move forward without having to get legislative changes; felt the City is missing the big issue; believed that the interpretation of HCD

should be given weight; talked about pending litigation challenging the Housing Element's compliance; addressed the Coastal Act and the City's need to enforce the LCP; stated the standards have not been met to reject the application and noted the burden of proof is on the City. He reported the Coastal Act needs to be harmonized with the Housing Accountability Act and offered to respond to questions from Council.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim invited public comments on this item.

Ray Lawson, South West Mountain States Regional Council of Carpenters and brothers, felt the Community Development Director's findings deeming the subject application, incomplete, should be upheld; spoke about tax fraud and waste and about rushing to solve the homeless issue; felt in the rush, questionable contractors and developers are allowed to proceed with projects to the detriment of the City and discussed lack of accountability.

Joseph Goldblatt, South West Mountain States Regional Council of Carpenters, stated that if the project is approved, the City should ensure that contractors use local hire and that workers have been trained through State-approved apprenticeship programs and discussed AB 2011 relative to workforce requirements.

James Matthews, South West Mountain States Regional Council of Carpenters, spoke about the importance of prioritizing the employment of local workers.

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to extend the speaker's time. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

James Matthews discussed the benefits of local hire including allowing the City to keep tax dollars in the City and pride of ownership.

Councilmember Obagi asked for examples of laws/provisions from other cities requiring local hire.

Javier Gudino, South West Mountain States Regional Council of Carpenters, discussed the benefits of local hire; noted he takes pride in his work; discussed AB 2011; spoke favorably about the apprenticeship program and thanked Council for its consideration.

Benedict Lubbon, Jude Benedict and Associates (a lobbying firm), spoke about the need for cooperation and discussed the need for planning and the need for the site to have something that is historically significant.

Kyle Johnson, District 1, via Zoom, expressed support for the project and hoped City Council will consider the plan.

Zae Dean, Manhattan Beach, via Zoom, spoke in support of the application and discussed the need for housing in the area.

Matthew Lawrence, Torrance, via Zoom, spoke in support of the application and discussed the need for housing in the area.

Sheila Lamb, District 4, via Zoom, spoke about the Builders Remedy for housing element non-compliance; noted Redondo Beach has made every effort to comply with the requirements of the Housing Element and felt the applicant's appeal should be denied.

Brianna Egan, via Zoom, spoke about City leadership advocating for the AES site to be turned into a large park and wetlands; believed the best and highest land use for the space would be residential; discussed the need for affordable housing in the area, to support the environment, being part of the solution and not the problem; referenced the Sierra Club's platform on housing and land use; talked about a green building boom and expressed support for the project.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, to extend the speaker's time. There being one objection (Councilmember Loewenstein), Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Brianna Egan listed benefits resulting from the project and the need to address climate goals.

Holly Osborne, District 5, via Zoom, pointed out that Redondo Beach is denser and has a higher, proportional RHNA requirement than Manhattan Beach and Torrance and felt the applicant's appeal should be denied.

Nancy Skiba, District 4, via Zoom, wondered how many of the proposed units will be affordable and talked about the need for more information about the project.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Kroneberger reported the people who submitted eComments also spoke via Zoom.

Michael Schonefeld, on behalf of 9300 Wilshire, LLC, asserted the City was in a state of non-compliance on the date of their submittal of their preliminary application, which he corrected to be August 15th, and that HCD determined it was not in compliance until September 1st; reiterated that the central issue is that the City, City Attorney and the Community Development Director do not agree that the Builders Remedy applies; felt other issues are irrelevant and commented on zoning options for the site.

In response to Councilmember Obagi's question regarding current zoning, Mr. Schonefeld stated it is confusing because of the LCP designation as a generating plant (GP); noted in other instances it is designated an industrial zone and reported the issue is that they need to return with something that is zoning-specific and not that they can pursue this particular proposal. He confirmed the Builders Remedy would allow them to build residential housing and a mixed-use component would conceivably allow them to build a hotel; stated the affordable component is part of the residential uses; commented on a reference to wetlands and its varied definitions; addressed the ownership affidavit; questioned the need to discuss the applicant's bankruptcy proceedings and alleged the Community Development Director asked them to change their project.

Mr. Schonefeld stated the HCD has made it clear that the jurisdiction has been in compliance as of the date of the HCD's letter, finding the adopted elements in compliance.

Councilmember Obagi noted Mr. Schonefeld was quoting from a letter, received yesterday; questioned the qualifications of the person writing the letter, adding that the opinion is hearsay and noted that the letter includes a reminder of the City's obligation to comply with the Coastal Act and that the City has an obligation to harmonize any application submitted to the City with the obligations under the Coastal Act.

Mr. Schonefeld stressed that the Builders Remedy allows builders under certain circumstances to proceed regardless of what the LCP or general planning zoning code says about zoning; believed those circumstances apply in this case and noted the documents/applications submitted is a matter of record.

In response to an inquiry from Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, Community Development Director Forbes listed the fees that have not been paid by the applicant to the City; noted the affidavit was not submitted, as claimed and explained there was no request for having to change the project but rather the applicable applications needing to be submitted were identified.

City Attorney Webb explained the project was not rejected and there is not statement indicating the City staff did not like the project and the application is deemed to be incomplete.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim spoke about the thousands of dollars being owed and pointed out errors in the dates listed in Mr. Schonefeld's letter.

Eugene Solomon asked who would be responsible for paying the fees for the application.

City Attorney Webb spoke about the need for them to get approval from the Bankruptcy Court before paying

any fees and discussed the process if the application were deemed to be complete.

In response to Councilmember Obagi's question, Mr. Schonefeld confirmed that he was in communication with the author of the HCD letter, in writing and over the telephone, and hoped that City Council will make a determination on this matter tonight.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to close the public hearing. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim commented on mistakes in the letter and notice of postings and thanked staff for their work on this item.

Councilmember Obagi thanked Community Development Director Forbes for the report; spoke about the lack of large parcels in Redondo Beach and noted the City is doing everything it can to improve access to affordable housing.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2305-043, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, UPHOLDING THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR'S DECISION TO DEEM THE APPLICATION INCOMPLETE FOR A PROPOSED MIXED-USE HOUSING PROJECT LOCATED AT 1100 N. HARBOR DRIVE [APN: 7503-013-014; 7503-013-015; 7503-013-819; 7503-013-820]. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Kroneberger read title to Resolution No. CC-2305-043.

#### RECESS/RECONVENE

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for a recess at 9:25 p.m. The meeting was reconvened at 9:36 p.m. with all Councilmembers present.

#### ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Obagi, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Brand

#### **M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS - None**

#### **N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION**

#### **N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE DIRECTION ON DRAFT ORDINANCES AMENDING REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE (RBMC) TITLE 10 CHAPTER 2 ZONING AND LAND USE AND TITLE 10 CHAPTER 5 COASTAL LAND USE PLAN IMPLEMENTING ORDINANCE PERTAINING TO INCLUSIONARY HOUSING REGULATIONS**

**CONTACT:** BRANDY FORBES, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Community Development Director Forbes introduced Consultant Kathy Head with Keyser Marston Associates, Inc. and deferred to her for a report.

Consultant Head narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the Inclusionary Housing Program for the

City of Redondo Beach including a summary of discussions by the Planning Commission.

Discussion followed regarding acquisition rehab, changes in State density bonus laws, allowable uses of in-lieu fees, capturing the affordability gap, applicability of Proposition 15, standards for market rate “for sale”, apartment and all residential projects, using county data versus city data, updated standards for market rate apartment projects, basis for determining sales price, utility allowances and in-lieu fee schedules.

Community Development Director Forbes addressed Planning Commission recommendations.

Discussion followed regarding using residential overlays for larger projects and in-fills for smaller projects, impacts from existing commercial uses and exploring the South Bay Housing Trust and other affordable housing funding options.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim spoke favorably regarding the Planning Commission recommendations.

Councilmember Obagi referenced existing overlays and in response to his question, Consultant Head reported they provide deeper affordability and would meet unit-quality standards, unit mix standards and non-clustering standards. Councilmember Obagi spoke about having the greatest discretion in the guidelines as far as how the City uses development in-lieu fees (i.e., pallet shelter); discussed starting with existing housing overlay zones; referenced SB 9 and talked about applying it for units two-five, anywhere in the City.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke about in-lieu fees and discouraging lot splits.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about having it in the residential overlay areas and felt it could be perceived that the area is already feeling a burden for the City, that the intent is for the areas to encourage more income-restricted housing and suggested including approving in-lieu fees for the entire City.

Discussion followed regarding concerns this could lead to intense densification and unintended consequences.

Councilmember Behrendt voiced support for affordable inclusionary housing; thanked City staff and Consultant Head for their work on this matter; discussed his review and participation in meetings where this item was discussed as well as his review of studies and publications and interviews with experts and members of the public and expressed concerns that the ordinance will result in greater density in places not necessarily preferred by the City, in concessions to developers, a potential watering down of development standards and result in increases in the cost of housing in the City for market-rate units and reductions in the supply of market-rate housing. Additionally, he stated he would rather study other options and tools for increasing affordable housing.

Discussion followed regarding the need to move cautiously and take the time that is needed to understand the item, fully, impacts to housing prices, directing staff to provide examples of cities that have implemented inclusionary housing and minimizing constraints to housing.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked staff to provide ten examples of municipalities that have implemented inclusionary housing ordinances in the past ten years including the effects on market-rate housing and development.

Discussion followed regarding the possibility of lowering in-lieu fees and exploring newer studies.

Councilmember Loewenstein left the meeting at 11:11 p.m.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Kroneberger reported receiving one eComment on this item indicating a neutral position.

Councilmember Obagi asked about specifying in-lieu fees for 1-5 units; felt there will be an upward pressure on prices but noted there is an upward pressure anyways as the supply is low and spoke in support of having some protections for affordability.

City Attorney Webb suggested deferring discussions on SB 9 until after Labor Day.

Holly Osborne, via Zoom, mentioned an existing project and wondered what the City will do to preserve its existing affordable housing.

There were no other public comments.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, to direct staff to return with an ordinance that applies a greater discounted in lieu for all projects of one net new unit or greater, City-wide, and a moderate income for residential overlays with the existing parameters, an update on the South Bay Housing Trust, and research ten cities with similar situations to see impacts growth and sales price, keeping the California tax credit comparison.

The Motion carried, 3-1-1, with the following roll call vote:

|          |                                              |
|----------|----------------------------------------------|
| AYES:    | Kaluderovic, Obagi, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim |
| NOES:    | Behrendt                                     |
| ABSENT:  | Loewenstein                                  |
| ABSTAIN: | None                                         |

## **N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON THE COORDINATION OF CITY VOLUNTEER OPPORTUNITIES**

**CONTACT:** DANA VINKE, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim spoke about the importance of volunteers in the community.

City Manager Witzansky introduced the item and deferred to Library Director Vinke for his work on this item.

Library Director Vinke presented details of the Administrative Report and discussed possible enhancements to the volunteer program.

Discussion followed regarding the Volunteer Management Software, background check requirements, evaluating the need for a Volunteer Coordinator position, creating efficiencies to cut costs, adding to the current network of volunteers and creating a volunteer planning and recognition event.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim invited public comments on this item.

Gil Escontra, President, Friends of the Redondo Beach Dog Park, Founder of Blue Line Dogs, a non-profit that provides therapy dogs for First Responders and Member of the City's Recreation and Parks Commission, spoke about the importance of volunteerism, communication and coordination; discussed volunteerism within the organizations and savings from the many hours of service; suggested the City considering getting a volunteer to run the volunteer program and spoke about the implementation of outreach efforts to all volunteer organizations using Parks and Recreation facilities and acknowledgements for anyone who does volunteer work within the City.

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, to extend the speaker's time. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Mr. Escontra addressed acknowledgement of volunteers and spoke about keeping Redondo Beach

volunteers in Redondo Beach.

Discussion followed regarding the Presidential Points of Light program and Mr. Escontra's proposed volunteer recognition program.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Obagi noted a basic volunteer opportunity involves picking up trash at City parks.

Discussion followed regarding exploring the possibility of finding a volunteer to run the volunteer program, turnover, training and responsibilities and implementing an "Adopt-a-Park" program.

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to approve the volunteer program and the current direction forward, start a coordination program for volunteer groups to meet with the City, direct staff to return with a budget item to approve program costs as mentioned in the Administrative Report, as needed and explore implementation of a volunteer acknowledgement program and direct staff to investigate the Presidential Points of Light program. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Council considered Item No. L.1. at this point.

#### **O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS**

City Manager Witzansky reported the next City Council meeting will include a presentation on the proposed City budget.

#### **P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS**

##### **P.1. DISCUSSION AND CONSIDERATION OF MAYOR'S APPOINTMENT TO THE BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMISSION**

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim announced that Nick Sheridan, District 2 is the Mayor's appointment to the Budget and Finance Commission, replacing Eugene Solomon.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke favorably about Nick Sheridan's qualifications and experience.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to approve the Mayor's appointment of Nick Sheridan to the Budget and Finance Commission. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

Council considered Item No. N.2. at this point.

#### **Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF**

Councilmember Kaluderovic made a referral to look at potential overnight permit parking for surrounding areas, including Dominguez Park and asked for a BRR for improvements at Franklin Park including concrete pillars and basketball hoops and a BRR for the median around Blumenthal and Ralston.

Councilmember Obagi requested a BRR for the median on Artesia, between Gravelly and Kingsdale.

#### **R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION - None**

**S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None**

**T. ADJOURNMENT: 11:48 p.m.**

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, to adjourn the meeting at 11:48 p.m., to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Open Session) on Tuesday, May 16, 2023, in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California. There being no objections, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim so ordered.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk